



ENOUGH IS NOT ENOUGH: MAINTAINING NEW YORK STATE AS A LEADER IN CAMPUS SEXUAL VIOLENCE PREVENTION



New York City Alliance
Against Sexual Assault



New York State Coalition
Against Sexual Assault
Working for a World Without Violence.

AUTHOR ORGANIZATIONS

The New York City Alliance Against Sexual Assault (the Alliance) works to prevent sexual violence and reduce the harm it causes through education, prevention programming, advocacy for survivors, and the pursuit of legal and policy changes. The Alliance was founded in 1999 by rape crisis centers in New York City in order to advocate for the needs of survivors and the organizations that serve them.

Formed in 1987 by rape crisis advocates as a mutual support group, the mission and purpose of the New York State Coalition Against Sexual Assault (NYSCASA) rapidly evolved from basic networking. The Coalition grew to include technical assistance, resource development and policy advocacy for the more than 100 Rape Crisis programs, sister agencies and collaborators statewide that work with survivors of sexual violence and their families. Today, NYSCASA works with local, regional state and national organizations all of whom are dedicated to ending sexual violence.

The New York City Alliance Against Sexual Assault (the Alliance) and the New York State Coalition Against Sexual Assault (NYSCASA) have worked as partners on multiple projects for many years. Both programs previously served as New York State's two Centers of Excellence in Sexual Assault Prevention, providing technical assistance (TA), training, resources and expertise to 80 Rape Crisis and Sexual Violence Prevention programs statewide together.

ABOUT THE AUTHOR

Tracia Banuelos-Rovaris (she/they) is a social researcher and facilitator. Receiving their MS in Applied Social Research from CUNY Hunter College, Banuelos-Rovaris' primary research interests center survivors of sexual violence, with special attention towards youth and kids of color. Banuelos-Rovaris has collaborated with organizations doing campus sexual violence prevention work since 2015, working with New York state schools and organizations since 2018. Banuelos-Rovaris has been published in the Journal of Black Sexuality and Relationships and the National Harm Reduction Coalition. She is currently conducting qualitative analysis in a multi-year research project with StopItNow! and the Center for Violence Prevention Research. In 2018, Banuelos-Rovaris won the "Next Generation" award from the Kansas Choice Alliance and was named a 2018 Civic Health Hero by the Kansas Health Foundation.

SPECIAL THANKS TO...

Thank you to the many people who worked to make this report a reality, including Tracia Banuelos-Rovaris, Sam Skaller, Mackenzie Christensen, Larissa Santana, Shriya Chatale, Emily Miles, and Will Rivera. Additionally, thank you to the many EIE coordinators, campus staff and administrators, students, and others who lent their expertise and experience to helping us better understand the EIE ecosystem.



TABLE OF CONTENTS

BACKGROUND.....	4
CURRENT LANDSCAPE OF CAMPUS ANTI-SEXUAL VIOLENCE PREVENTION WORK.....	5
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Compliance monitoring before & after COVID-19 pandemic • Underutilization of Campus Coordinated Response Teams (CCRTs) • Innovating & implementing beyond primary prevention 	
FISCAL ROADBLOCKS & PROGRAMMATIC CHALLENGES.....	9
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High volume of staff turnover, burnout, & limited hiring capacity eroding institutional knowledge • Navigating Title IX and training campus personnel 	
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR POLICYMAKERS.....	11
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase annual funding by \$5.1 million for Enough is Enough Programs to \$9.6 million • \$1.5 million to fund a three year, statewide Campus Coordinated Response Team demonstration project • Conduct an Enough is Enough compliance evaluation post COVID-19 	
CONCLUSION.....	13
APPENDICES.....	14
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Appendix A: List of frequently referenced terms • Appendix B: Campus Sexual Violence Following the Passage of 'Enough is Enough': Recommendations from the Field (September, 2016) • Appendix C: Coordinated Community Response: A guide to creating and maintaining institution-wide responsibility for the prevention of, and response to, sexual and domestic violence (April, 2018) • Appendix D: Preliminary Report: Statewide Review of Compliance with Education Law Article 129-B (September, 2017) • Appendix E: 2021-2022 Annual Report: The Enough is Enough Grant Program • Appendix F: Collegiate Sexual Assault Resource Guide 	



BACKGROUND

In 2015, New York State's rollout of Education Law Article 129-B, commonly referred to as '[Enough is Enough](#)' (EiE), generated an example of model legislation for states working to codify campus sexual violence prevention efforts. However, while the landscape around campus sexual violence has shifted significantly, funding for Enough is Enough has completely stagnated over the last eight years. EiE stakeholders are gravely concerned by the efficacy and vitality of prevention efforts due to these heavy fiscal constraints.

Enough is Enough, as it stands, provides a general foundation for a cohesive, statewide approach to combatting campus sexual violence through mandated uniform definitions of affirmative consent and amnesty policies, clear pathways to short-term counseling and medical services for survivors of sexual violence, including Sexual Assault Nurse Examiners (SANE) services, adoption and evaluation of an ongoing student training suite, and other mandates that require staff/faculty training and compliance monitoring for due diligence. Often referred to as one of the most ambitious policies in the nation at that time, this legislation responded to the need for a community collaboration between local rape crisis centers (RCCs) and college campuses to bolster each other's prevention efforts by providing funding to RCCs engaging in campus sexual assault prevention and response. Managed by the Office for the Prevention of Domestic Violence (OPDV), 53 rape crisis centers and organizations in New York (hereon referred to as EIE Providers) receive funding to support EIE mandates, including but not limited to: create Campus Coordinated Response Teams (CCRTs), support and review campus climate surveys, create and deliver trainings and workshops for all stakeholders on college campuses, train and mentor student leaders, and operate as campus sexual violence consultants.

This paper was developed from insight gained from recent and ongoing interviews with key stakeholders in the fight against campus sexual violence such as: student survivors, alumni, lawyers, Enough is Enough providers, healthcare providers, and leaders within the campus sexual assault prevention field. Participants have engaged with anti-sexual violence prevention efforts in New York State as students, professional interns, researchers, and staff in the field, with some starting their roles recently and others having up to 29 years of relevant experience. Information was sourced from in-depth document reviews of resources developed by [The New York State Training and Technical Assistance Center](#) (TTA), housed by the Alliance and NYSCASA, such as the Statewide 2022-2023 needs assessment, representing the voices of 52 out of 53 EiE Providers across the State.

The Enough is Not Enough Campaign is a multi-year initiative with direct sign-on from over 25 rape crisis centers, organizations, and 110+ individual stakeholders, providing ongoing feedback and recommendations to our advocacy efforts.

CURRENT LANDSCAPE OF CAMPUS ANTI-SEXUAL VIOLENCE WORK:

Compliance monitoring before & after COVID-19 pandemic

Enough is Enough went into effect statewide during Fall 2016. Since then, a plethora of resources were developed to assist college campuses and universities to maintain compliance. One resource is the September 2016 “Campus Sexual Violence Following the Passage of ‘Enough is Enough’: Recommendations from the Field” white paper authored by the New York State Campus Sexual Violence Working Group, a statewide multi-organization advocacy space for campus sexual violence prevention. Outlining clear recommendations on how to use data to ensure responsive policies and identifying best practices in campus work, that paper began a conversation with campus professionals on how and where to begin to collaborate with EIE Providers to offer services to survivors.

A year later, in 2017, through a Governor direction, the NYS Office of Campus Safety found that only 95 of 244 colleges and universities in New York were compliant and up to date with EIE mandates. While many campuses had taken steps to become compliant, major gaps existed within their campus policies, training consistency, interim measures and accommodations for both reporting and accused students, and the general advertisement of available resources. While a Phase II to this Governor’s review was planned, there is no publicly available record of the follow-up.

Since there is no available data since 2017 it is difficult to accurately quantify and qualify the ongoing impact that the COVID-19 pandemic has had on the campus sexual violence landscape in New York State. However, anecdotally we know that the COVID-19 pandemic has placed a massive strain on campus safety in general and for survivors and victims of sexual violence specifically. For example, the immediate shift to remote instruction in March 2020 left survivors who once used their campuses as safe havens away from abusive households with no other options than to go back to unsafe living environments. At an additional disadvantage, student parents using childcare resources on campus as a means to protect their children from abusive partners living in the home were left with no safe alternatives. On and off campus resources that could have been there to support students in these situations were not prepared to do so in a virtual landscape. Furthermore, staff turnover on and off campus due to staff layoffs, staff leaving positions, and in some cases COVID-19 related death created another layer of trauma as well as unstable and unreliable support systems for student safety.

Currently, EIE providers are addressing the aftermath of the collective trauma caused by COVID-19 on college campuses, while also managing typical caseloads in an altered environment. In their 2021-2022 Annual Report, the Office for Prevention Domestic Violence highlighted that over 60 higher education campuses in New York are not affiliated with an official EIE designated program, accounting for over 92,000 students who do not have access to EIE services under the current funding structure. Having completed two entire academic years under New York State’s lifted COVID-19 safety guidelines, now is the ideal time to collect further information. Data such as campus services’ efficacy, general campus climate, and the voices of student survivors who have experienced new types of harm including but not limited to evolving forms of cyber-sexual abuse would be essential in informing EIE programs’ approach to campus partnerships.



Underutilization of Campus Coordinated Response Teams (CCRTs)

Coordinated Community Response Teams (CCRTs) are excellent ways to engage entire campus and off campus support structures in the fight against campus sexual violence.

CCRTs recognize that victims of violence must interact with multiple sources of assistance to get the help required to escape and heal from violence and that only a macro shift in beliefs and behavior will stop the violence. The CCRT model generates these responses through 1) creating policies and procedures that solicits input from various agencies, including law enforcement, rape crisis centers, and the court system; 2) ensuring survivors' voices are central to decisions being made; 3) and engaging in environmental prevention by working with offenders.

What is essential in every CCRT is compensated student participation. Current students and recent alumni are often willing and eager to support anti-violence work in their campus as an avenue of applied learning and because of a passion for human services. Many students shared that they feel responsible for taking on campus sexual violence prevention efforts because they do not see or trust their schools to do so properly. Students remain the catalysts for change at their schools and should be supported properly for their continued contributions. CCRTs offer these students spaces for their voices to be heard and embedded in important decision making in creating safer campus communities.

Even though CCRTs are widely seen as a best practice in holistically addressing campus sexual violence and its aftermath, according to the 2022-2023 EIE Provider Needs Assessment, there is a reported statewide decrease in the use of Coordinated Community Response Teams (CCRTs) as compared to previous years. Moreover, even before the COVID-19 pandemic, it was a challenge for campuses to sustain CCRTs and to establish partnerships between CCRTs and EIE programs. It is time to thoughtfully invest in CCRTs as a critical mechanism for campus sexual violence prevention and survivor support throughout the state.

Innovating & implementing beyond primary prevention

“Where do I go when I need to have a specialized expertise on gender based violence for individuals with disabilities?” - A campus administrator

Our existing suite of introductory (“101”) workshops on consent education and bystander intervention are insufficient and not reflective of the complex sexual situations that students are asking for support with. Preventionists on campus today find themselves relearning their roles and adapting to changing student needs and popular discourse to engage in authentic dialogue with students. Fostering genuine connections with current college students necessitates expanding a collective viewpoint of who these students are beyond the “typical” college student trope, as well as incorporating programming that is reflective of an updated understanding. Implicit ideas of a “traditional” college student are communicated consciously or unconsciously through images, examples, and student incentives. Often, this “traditional” college student connotes images of able-bodied, childless, 18-22 year olds, perhaps with limited sexual experience. However, this all-too-common perception further marginalizes multiple demographics of students most impacted by sexual violence.

Too many students left out of dominant campus sexual violence conversations identify the need for a larger discourse about sex and sexual literacy before immediately jumping into discussions about sexual violence. EIE Providers find themselves having to simultaneously work backwards to fill gaps in college students’ understanding of sexual literacy and be extremely forward-thinking about how to prevent violence in a growing digital society. Providers not only are requested to deliver workshops on healthy sexual development, but also to speak as panelists and join committees to generate ideas on innovative prevention practices.

Collectively, this generation of student learners across all ages are having conversations at a greater volume due to the increase of utilization and access to mental health and anti-violence discourse on evolving social media platforms. Students would like access to nuanced content that contributes to what they already consume online, such as:

- Deepfakes, “revenge porn” and cyber-sexual abuse
- Cyber-safety on dating and hookup apps
- STI/STD prevention and testing information
- Understanding the role trauma plays in healthy sexual activity
- Safe practices for engaging in sexual activity while using alcohol or drugs

Further limiting the potential impact of EIE programs, there are currently no resources on the list of supported evidence-based curricula that center high-risk students, namely: Black, Indigenous, and Students of Color, low-income students, LGBTQIA+ & QTPOC students, students with disabilities, student parents, or adult learners in a campus environment. While the average cost to procure existing, non-culturally-responsive evidence-based curriculum varies, it is often more expensive than the current funding structures allow. Even with virtual training options, the risk-reward ratio of an evidence-based program that continues to exclude the needs and experiences of high-risk populations is too much of a financial gamble for struggling EIE Providers to absorb. Recent needs assessment data shows that EIE Providers are pivoting away from the programs they are trained in, and 33% of programs are using “homegrown” trainings. These unique programs are designed and used within specific settings, and may work for specific populations or cultures.

The New York State Training and Technical Assistance Center (TTA) has done its best to stay abreast of changes, emerging best practices, and trending conversations within the campus sexual violence prevention field despite very limited resources. Providers already have their own resources and coaching opportunities available to provide a general suite of campus trainings and programs to first year students, student leaders, student employees/resident advisors, and school staff. However, support for requests for the following groups continues to be in high demand: high-risk student populations, students of color, international students, students with intellectual and/or physical disabilities, commuter students, transfer students, student athletes, graduate students, student parents, and athletic staff.

TTA, EIE Providers, and campuses need adequate culturally responsive resources to develop and implement high-quality program materials that respond to the needs students historically left out of current primary prevention efforts.



FISCAL ROADBLOCKS & PROGRAMMATIC CHALLENGES

High volume of staff turnover, burnout, & limited hiring capacity eroding institutional knowledge

Colleges and universities that utilize Enough is Enough Providers receive high-quality service at no cost to them. Each EIE Provider operates as an anti-violence consultant for their campus partners. This role requires them to be fluent in applicable federal and state laws and regulations, able to deliver nuanced workshops, skilled in data collection and analysis, and adept at developing student leaders. They are positioned as liaisons between schools and their EIE programs, fielding questions from faculty and staff, and often running peer support groups and volunteer groups simultaneously.

Unfortunately, the level of funding provided to EIE programs results in many struggling to find and retain highly qualified staff to lead this work. Many can only afford to hire recent graduates without children, fresh out of school with little field experience. Staff turnover has reached unprecedented levels due to insufficient compensation and a dearth of opportunities for professional advancement. The rate of pay compared to the responsibility for such work is extremely unbalanced. Under current funding structures, many programs receiving EIE funding cannot afford a full time staff member dedicated solely to EIE, resulting in programs splitting staff member time and compensation between the EIE grant and other grants. For example, 20% of EIE programs do not have a single staff member dedicating no more than 50% of their time for EIE responsibilities.

"We have our individual case loads, we have on-call days. So that means that you sign up for a certain number of shifts every month, depending on how many people are on your team... And basically when you're on call, you can be called for any you know domestic sexual assault or violent emergency within the hospital you show up... Phone calls that we get throughout the day and the hotline emails that we get - we are to respond to all of those when we're on call [and] our individual caseload in addition to our EIE work." - EIE Provider

With each lost staff member, historical records and institutional knowledge around progress made with their campuses and partner sites is lost, with many programs starting from scratch to rebuild their programs when new coordinators are hired. Further exacerbating this crisis in EIE program turnover is staff turnover at campus partner institutions. For example, there may be 2-3 different Title IX coordinators throughout just one academic year. All this turnover in staffing disrupts campus partnerships requiring new relationships between EIE programs and campuses to be fostered, underscored by building familiarity of vastly changing campus climates. All of this exists at a time when off-campus support structures across New York State, such as Sexual Assault Forensic Examiner (SAFE) programs, are experiencing similar high turnover and lack of resources.

Over 92,000 students in New York State attend campuses not connected to an EIE program. It is estimated that at least 11,960 of those students are survivors of sexual violence, none of whom will be guided through a path of healing and safety with a trained EIE provider.



Navigating Title IX and training campus personnel

"You need a specialized skill set to do this work... people who have worked in this field before, people like former Title IX coordinators, former sex crimes prosecutors, former criminal defense attorneys, this is the pool, not to say that no one else could do it.

They could. But it is a niche skill set"

While Enough is Enough provides pathways for generating solutions to campus sexual violence issues in New York State, EiE Providers are the campuses' first points of contact to make sense of federal Title IX updates. Reflected in the aforementioned EiE Needs Assessment, over 60% of EiE Providers are looking for training and technical assistance in their understanding of Title IX and Enough is Enough legislation. 30% of EiE Providers facilitated training for Title IX investigators in the last year, yet there currently are no mechanisms for students and schools to be brought up to date on their rights as Title IX continues to undergo incredibly significant changes since 2015. Enough is Enough Providers & TTA are filling this gap on their own time. Currently there are no provisions or resources within EiE for navigating the ever-changing federal legislation that is Title IX.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR POLICYMAKERS

If New York State is to maintain its national position as a leader in campus sexual violence prevention, we recommend:

- An increase of \$5.1 million for Enough is Enough Programs and TTA to a total of \$9.6 million annually
- \$1.5 million over the course of a three-year period for a statewide Campus Coordinated Response Team demonstration project
- A state-led Enough is Enough compliance evaluation post COVID-19

Increase annual funding for Enough is Enough Programs to \$9.6 million

New York State must secure the longevity and scope of Enough is Enough providers by committing to a minimum total annual investment of \$9.6 million into EiE programming

This increased investment would:

- Provide all NYS schools, including the ones not currently connected to an EIE provider, with access to properly resourced EIE programs
- Recruit, retain, and appropriately compensate expert full-time EIE staff to provide more comprehensive, high-quality, and culturally responsive programming to all higher education campuses in New York State
- Allow for staff time and expand resources to creating culturally responsive and linguistically appropriate program materials

This funding would also serve to strengthen the Statewide Training & Technical Assistance Program to:

- Adequately support all 53 EIE programs
- Develop appropriate support models that meet the unique needs of all NYS campuses
- Provide expert guidance in changes to federal and state laws that directly impact student survivors.
- Host regular professional development spaces, events, and convenings connecting EIE to other NYS support structures serving student survivors and victims.

\$1.5 million to fund a three year, statewide Campus Coordinated Response Team demonstration project

Each campus has their own unique strengths and challenges, which require a differentiated approach to meet the needs of their student population. In an effort to address those needs while working to break down silos between key stakeholder communities (e.g., students, campus faculty and administration, rape crisis programs, and law enforcement), we are asking New York State to fund a Campus Coordinated Response Team (CCRT) demonstration project. This three year project would fund the start up and evaluation of five CCRTs across the state, with a goal of developing guidance and best practices for institutes of higher education that can be used as the foundation for a more comprehensive strategy to develop CCRTs at every college.

Beyond their best practice utility, CCRTs have the potential to offer effective structures for campuses to address state requirements for the impending 2024 compliance filing to New York State Education Department (SED):

“...each institution is required by Education Law §6440(1) to adopt written rules implementing this article by amending its code of conduct or other comparable policies. A copy of these rules and policies must be filed with SED on or before July 1, 2016. Updated policies must be filed at least every 10 years, except that the second filing shall coincide with the required filing of a certificate of compliance under Article 129-A of the Education Law, and continue on the same cycle thereafter... If an institution fails to file a certificate of compliance on or before September 1, 2016, and annually thereafter, the institution will be ineligible for any State aid or assistance until the certificate is filed. SED will conduct random audits, at any time after September 1, 2016 to ensure compliance with the provisions of this article”.

A state-funded CCRT demonstration project will generate needed data on current challenges universities face in developing CCRTs and also ascertain best practices for other universities.

Conduct an Enough is Enough compliance evaluation post COVID-19

Though the State Education Department is charged with ensuring campus compliance with Enough is Enough legislation, the annual reports currently published by NYSED serve only as incident reports and lack the data necessary to determine if and how colleges and universities are complying with all aspects of the EIE.

To ensure all students are being served appropriately and in alignment with Enough is Enough requirements, New York State must conduct a formal compliance review of all higher education institutions. This statewide compliance review would culminate in a report similar to the one conducted in 2017 (Appendix D). This review will generate current data on where campuses stand in compliance and identify where they need the most support. EIE Providers and Technical Assistance providers can collaborate together efficiently and effectively, informed by the latest and most accurate and up-to-date data regarding the culture around campus sexual violence in New York State.



CONCLUSION

New York State has the opportunity to remain a national leader in state-led responsiveness and sustainable investment in violence prevention. EiE Providers have the skill, passion, and nuance to create homegrown, sustainable prevention programming when adequately funded. The New York State Training and Technical Assistance Center has the potential to be the central hub for statewide compliance monitoring and evaluation of Enough is Enough activities and lessons learned along the way. TTA has the potential to function as a vital intermediary between key stakeholders. Channeling prevention efforts through TTA is an opportunity to streamline coordination between EiE Providers, campuses, law enforcement, and other community agencies to really address violence at the community level. With targeted funding increases for EiE, TTA, and mandated requirements for CCRTs, New York State is positioning itself for a truly current, comprehensive statewide prevention strategy. The culmination of a statewide compliance review will not only identify priorities for TTA, but also equip other New York State agencies with current data. In this critical moment, New York State's commitment to supporting survivors and ensuring the safety of all students hinges upon investment in this funding request.

APPENDIX A: LIST OF FREQUENTLY REFERENCED TERMS

- **Sexual Violence:** refers to any non-consensual sexual act or behavior inflicted upon an individual. It encompasses a wide range of actions, including but not limited to rape, sexual assault, sexual harassment, cyber-sexual violence, and other forms of sexual misconduct.
- **EIE Provider** refers to a rape crisis center, advocacy organization, or hospital that accepts Enough is Enough grant funding to implement campus sexual violence prevention work. Some agencies provide direct services (counseling, therapy, medical support, legal services) through access to other grant funding.
- **OPDV** refers to the Office for Prevention of Domestic Violence, the current “home” for EiE since 2020.
- **DOH** refers to the NYS Department of Health, previous “home” for EiE from 2016-2020.
- **TTA** refers to The New York State Center for Training and Technical Assistance, established through a joint partnership between the New York City Alliance Against Sexual Assault (the Alliance) and the New York State Coalition Against Sexual Assault (NYSCASA), which supports the efforts of Rape Crisis and Sexual Violence Programs (RCSVPs) to deliver quality sexual violence prevention and response services.
- **SAFE** refers to the Sexual Assault Forensic Exam. The certified medical professional who performs a SAFE is exam is sometimes known as a Sexual Assault Nurse Examiner or SANE.
- **CCRT** refers to a Coordinated Community Response Team, a formal collaboration between university faculty, administrators, staff and students, and local community partners to establish prevention of and response protocol to sexual and domestic violence.
- **SART** refers to a Sexual Assault Response Team, not to be conflated with a CCRT. A campus SART responds to specific incidents, solves problems, and conducts case review. These teams may include the Title IX coordinator, investigators, student conduct personnel, and campus advocates.
- **Campus Climate Surveys** are campus-wide surveys administered to better understand students' perceptions and experiences, identify strengths and areas for improvement, and measure year-over-year progress on key initiatives. EiE mandates that campus climate surveys are conducted every other year. [See an example of CUNY's Campus Climate survey and results.](#)
- **QTPOC** refers to Queer and Transgender People of Color.

ADDITIONAL APPENDICES

Appendix B: Campus Sexual Violence Following the Passage of 'Enough is Enough': Recommendations from the Field (September, 2016)

Appendix C: Coordinated Community Response: A guide to creating and maintaining institution-wide responsibility for the prevention of, and response to, sexual and domestic violence (April, 2018)

Appendix D: Preliminary Report: Statewide Review of Compliance with Education Law Article 129-B (September, 2017)

Appendix E: 2021-2022 Annual Report: The Enough is Enough Grant Program

Appendix F: Collegiate Sexual Assault Resource Guide